Strengthening the Capacity of Local Governments in Developing Countries to Effectively Manage Infrastructure Assets

May 2023
Our team

Rania Abdulkader
School of International and Public Affairs

Paola Cala Ortiz
School of International and Public Affairs

Xiting Chen
School of International and Public Affairs

Pingzhang Li
School of International and Public Affairs

Jun-Soo Park
School of International and Public Affairs

Harshita Sakhamuri
School of International and Public Affairs

Rodrigo Salinas Giordano
School of International and Public Affairs

Tiancheng Wang
School of International and Public Affairs
1. Overview
2. Hypothesis
3. Case Studies
4. Prospects for the Projects
5. Conclusions and Recommendations
Overview

**Context:** Local governments in emerging and developing countries can benefit from tailored Public Private Partnership (PPP) arrangements to improve Infrastructure Asset Management (IAM) to deliver public goods sustainably. Challenges include:

- Limited financial resources
- Potential moral hazard
- Interoperability of new technology
- Sustainable revenue

**Objective:** Identify innovative and sustainable financing solutions for municipalities to support IAM throughout its entire lifecycle

**Theoretical approach:** The research examined four infrastructure projects based on the following:

- Notable financing and/or technological components
- Potential for replicability in diverse national contexts
- Capacity to enhance the provision of essential services
### Hypothesis

Understanding how the adoption of technology, notable financing mechanisms, and procurement mitigates moral hazard, and increases social and financial returns of existing Public-Private Partnerships at the subnational level, in alignment with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rio case</td>
<td>How guarantees from government finance institutions can facilitate the issuance of &quot;infrastructure-backed&quot; debentures, attracting international Qualified Institutional Buyers (QIBs) and contributing to the financing of IAM in the context of Public-Private Partnerships (PPP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beijing case</td>
<td>Establishment of clear revenue/risk management mechanism mitigates risks for stakeholders, resulting in increased operational efficiency and decreased government funding liability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pune Case</td>
<td>Responsible use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) Tech in traffic management systems reduces operational and maintenance costs, along with traffic accidents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haikou case</td>
<td>Strong due diligence and risk hedging based on demand estimation to structure stable and profitable projects to attract private and technology investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Funding parties</strong></td>
<td>Public partner: Rio Luz, the state-owned concessionaire. Private partner: The Smart Luz Consortium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of funding</strong></td>
<td>Municipalities with COSIP revenue, the Public Lighting Contribution collected on electricity bills by the local energy distribution company Lights S.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Budget</strong></td>
<td>USD 256 MN for operation and maintenance over a 20-year period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Revenue</strong></td>
<td>Combination of COSIP (Contribuição para o Custeio do Serviço de Iluminação Pública), Equity and Ancillary revenues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Innovation component</strong></td>
<td>Internet of Things (IoT) network connecting 300,000 LED luminaires and 25,000+ others including cameras, wireless sensors, and WiFi access points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency development</strong></td>
<td>Efficient provisioning of services leading to energy conservation. Innovation in ancillary revenue streams to maximise shared profits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rio de Janeiro, Brazil - Risk Mitigation

National PPP Framework
- Provides institutionality and consistency across projects, creating an appetite for the asset class
- PPP risk assignment mechanism

Certainty of COSIP Revenue
- COSIP (Contribuição para o Custeio do Serviço de Iluminação Pública) is earmarked only for project purpose
- Structured revenue waterfall and escrow account reduces uncertainty

DFC Guarantee
- Efficiently hedged project risk, by increasing risk rating above that of the Sovereign

Conditional Guarantee
- Covers minimal risk of BRL appreciating vs. USD
### Rio de Janeiro, Brazil - Key Takeaways

#### Lessons Learned

1. Combining certainty in revenue generation with strong project structuring enhances private capacity to access financing for a new asset class
2. DFC (United States International Development Finance Corporation) guarantee enables first of its kind repackaging of debentures to be purchased by international Qualified Institutional Buyers, making the asset class investable

#### Conditions for Replicability

1. Standardised PPP framework increases potential for viability
2. Sufficient guarantee reduces project risk
3. Armaarked asset revenue is allocated to the Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV) fostering bankability
4. Up-front clear impact demonstrates potential to unlock funding
Beijing, China - Risk Mitigation Structures In Public Transportation

Funding parties
- **Public Partner**: A subnational government owned entity, Beijing Infrastructure Investment Company (BIIC)
- **Private Partner**: A joint venture company, BJ MTR, formed by Hong Kong MTR (HK MTR), Beijing Capital Group (BCG) and BIIC

Type of funding
- **Mix of Public and Private funds**
  - **Public Partner (70%)**: BIIC provides funding for the construction process of the asset
  - **Private Partner (30%)**: BJ MTR focuses on the acquisition of rolling stock and other equipments

Budget
- **15.3 B CNY** (Equivalent to **2.2B USD**) for the completion of the project

Revenue
- Ticket Sales & Advertising Revenue

Innovation component
- Exclusive 30-year operation rights / Exit Option for Private Partner in case of poor financial management or unforeseen events

Agency development
- Private party (HK MTR) trains the high-competent local talent to ensure seamless transition at the end of the exclusive period
Beijing, China - Risk Mitigation

Clear Funding, Asset Share & Revenue Streams

- **Funding:**
  - **Part A (Construction)** solely funded by the BIIC with a total investment of 10.7 billion RMB (1.55 billion USD)
  - **Part B (Rolling stock)** financed by the joint venture Beijing MTR, with an investment of 4.6 billion RMB (0.67 billion USD)

- **Ownership of the Assets:**
  At the end of the 30-year exclusive period, BIIC will acquire Part B, at no extra cost, resulting in full ownership of the entire metro system

- **Revenue Streams:**
  - **Private:** Entitled revenues from ticket sales and advertisements
  - **Public:** Annual rental fee for Part A & Corporate Taxes. In 2010, the rental fee was 42.5 M CNY (6.17 M USD)
Beijing, China - Key Takeaways

Lessons Learned

1. **Transparent Contractual Agreements**: Clear terms, conditions and responsibilities resulted in smoother project execution and collaboration among stakeholders.

2. **Comprehensive Risk Mitigation**: Identification of potential risks, development of contingency plans and reassessment of risks throughout the project.

3. **Cost Control**: Robust cost control mechanisms contributed to minimizing government intervention and subsidies.

Conditions for Replicability

1. **Adaptable Frameworks**: Contractual and flexible risk frameworks enable private partners to accept the risk of losses while retaining exit rights.

2. **Continuous Monitoring**: Frequent evaluation of the use and performance of assets in relation to their ability to meet or exceed projected expectations.

3. **Separation between government and enterprises**: Independent operation of enterprises, enhancing stability while improving the management of public transportation.
### Pune, India - Integrating New Technologies into IAM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Funding parties</strong></th>
<th>Consortium of private companies, banks, and financial institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of funding</strong></td>
<td>Equity from a consortium of private companies and financial institutions loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Budget</strong></td>
<td>178 Million INR (25 Million USD) for the operation and maintenance over 10 year period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Revenue</strong></td>
<td>The estimated revenue-to-cost ratio for the next 10 years is projected to be significant - 87:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Innovation component</strong></td>
<td>AI applications linked with traffic management systems are used efficiently to reduce costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency development</strong></td>
<td>Gov't avoids upfront payments &amp; pressure with 10-year PPP; private parties cover maintenance, then gov't assumes ownership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Empirically Effective Framework

**Data management lifecycle**

Establish clear governance and lifecycle practices (creation, storage, sharing, archive, and deletion) to ensure data protection

**Privacy and Confidentiality**

Protect sensitive data with anonymization and strict access controls, use Privacy-Enhancing Technologies (PETs)

**Data Security and Unauthorized Access**

Implement encryption, secure storage, and intrusion detection systems, and conduct regular security audits

**Data Quality, Bias, and Misuse**

Ensure quality and diversity in training data, address biases, and research methods to reduce biases in AI outputs
Pune, India - Key Takeaways

Lessons Learned/Areas of improvement

1. **Strong project governance:** To establish robust governance framework: transparency, accountability, dispute resolution, regular monitoring, and reporting
2. **Competitive bidding process:** To ensure the best-qualified bidder is selected, providing value for money
3. **Clear roles & responsibilities:** To align stakeholders and promotes a common goal

Conditions for Replicability

1. **Political support:** In the absence of regulation, robust, enforceable contracts, and legal frameworks regulating PPPs across national and subnational levels
2. **Financial viability:** Financing plan and revenue-sharing mechanism, including dispute resolution mechanisms
3. **Technical expertise:** Procurement based on expertise (vs. relationship-driven) to design, install, and maintain the infrastructure
4. **Robust governance framework:** Budgetary sufficiency to meet the financial requirements, the project demands, and standards
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Funding parties</strong></th>
<th>ALBA Group (German company), the funder, builder, and operator, through open bidding process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of funding</strong></td>
<td>100% funding by the company, BOO (Build-Own-Operate) mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Budget</strong></td>
<td>Construction cost the company $10 million USD Government pays $6 million US a year on average, price resets in every 3 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Innovation component</strong></td>
<td>Strong due diligence, Multilateral risk mitigation, and new techs that improve waste recycling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency development</strong></td>
<td>Government designed a stable and profitable municipal project attracting private investment, contributing to SDGs, reducing costs and pollution, and increases recycling level</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Haikou, China - Risk Mitigation

- **Upside for the company:**
  - Revenue from waste processing is guaranteed by the government using subsidy

- **Upside for the government:**
  - Reducing cost
  - Quality of the treatment is monitored by independent third-parties
  - Power to fine or suspend the facility if the treatment doesn't meet contract standards

Graph 2. Decision Flows of the Haikou Waste Disposal PPP Project
Haikou, China - Key Takeaways

Lessons Learned

1. **Strong due diligence**
   The government can implement due diligence to ensure project efficiency and profitability, with outside experts if in need

2. **Multilateral risk mitigation**
   The government can set up third-party environmental audit to monitor the operation, and enforce regulation with preset dispute mitigation mechanism

Conditions for Replicability

1. **Beneficiary relationship with private entities** - The concept of equal placement has enabled both entities to collaborate effectively to achieve greater good for the public

2. **Population size and density** - Centralized waste disposal facilities are cost-effective and can accommodate large amounts of waste, making them suitable for a densely populated city like Haikou
Prospects of the Projects

Rio de Janeiro
Exclusivity and the potential for expandability of shared-ancillary revenue incentivize innovation. As does moving towards 100% renewable energy.

Beijing
Potential for replication in other cities, ultimately enhancing urban sustainability by promoting growth in connectivity and reducing congestion and air pollution.

Pune
Leverage adaptive traffic control and integrated technologies from global systems.

Haikou
Expanding treatment capacity and service areas reducing harm to citizens and the city environment.
## Conclusions and Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rio de Janeiro</td>
<td>Predictability of revenue stream supported by the legal framework and technical structure can foster financial innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beijing</td>
<td>Contractual agreements which clearly define the responsibility of each party and their respective risk/revenue trade-offs can increase efficiency and minimize disputes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pune</td>
<td>Open and accessible information fosters transparency to improve decision-making and constituents’ trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haikou</td>
<td>Strong due diligence and risk hedging based on demand estimation to structure predictable and profitable projects can attract private interest and foster technological investment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bibliography

Graph 1. Funding, Asset Share & Revenue Stream

Graph 2. Decision Flows of the Haikou Waste Disposal PPP Project
Planning document, 2015. Haikou food waste disposal PPP project
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AI</td>
<td>Artificial Intelligence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCG</td>
<td>Beijing Capital Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIIC</td>
<td>Beijing Infrastructure Investment Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOO</td>
<td>Build-Own-Operate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSIP</td>
<td>Contribuição para o Custeio do Serviço de Iluminação Pública</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFC</td>
<td>Development Finance Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HK MTR</td>
<td>Hong Kong Mass Transit Railway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAM</td>
<td>Infrastructure Asset Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Public Private Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PET</td>
<td>Privacy-Enhancing Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QIB</td>
<td>Qualified Institutional Buyer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDG</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPV</td>
<td>Special Purpose Vehicle</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>